**What is the evidence for the impact of ocean warming on subtropical and temperate corals and coral reefs? A systematic map.**

Man Lim Ho, Centre for Marine Science and Innovation, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

[Man\_lim.ho@unsw.edu.au](mailto:Man_lim.ho@unsw.edu.au)  
Malgorzata Lagisz, Evolution & Ecology Research Centre, School of Biological, Earth, Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia. [M.lagisz@unsw.edu.au](mailto:M.lagisz@unsw.edu.au)

Shinichi Nakagawa, Evolution & Ecology Research Centre, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

[S.nakagawa@unsw.edu.au](mailto:S.nakagawa@unsw.edu.au)

Sarah Perkins-Kirkpatrick, Fenner School of Environment & Society, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia.

[Sarah.kirkpatrick@anu.edu.au](mailto:Sarah.kirkpatrick@anu.edu.au)

Paige Sawyers, Centre for Marine Science and Innovation, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

[P.sawyers@unsw.edu.au](mailto:P.sawyers@unsw.edu.au)

Bill Leggat, School of Environmental and Life Sciences, The University of Newcastle, Ourimbah, NSW, Australia.

[Bill.leggat@newcastle.edu.au](mailto:Bill.leggat@newcastle.edu.au)

Troy Gaston, School of Environmental and Life Sciences, The University of Newcastle, Ourimbah, NSW, Australia.

[Troy.gaston@newcastle.edu.au](mailto:Troy.gaston@newcastle.edu.au)

Alistair Hobday, CSIRO Oceans and Atmosphere, Hobart, TAS, Australia.

[Alistair.hobday@csiro.au](mailto:Alistair.hobday@csiro.au)

Zoe Richards, School of Molecular and Life Sciences, Curtin University, Perth, WA, Australia.

[Zoe.richards@curtin.edu.au](mailto:Zoe.richards@curtin.edu.au)

Tracy Ainsworth, Centre for Marine Science and Innovation, School of Biological, Earth & Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

[Tracy.ainsworth@unsw.edu.au](mailto:Tracy.ainsworth@unsw.edu.au)

In preparation for submissions to Environmental Evidence.

**Abstract**

Background.

Subtropical coral reefs are important, yet comparatively understudied ecosystems that host a diverse and abundant array of marine life and provide substantial socio-economic benefits to communities. Research into the impacts of climate change on subtropical coral reefs increased over the past two decades as severe, extreme, and increasingly frequent degradation events are recorded in the systems. Understanding the extent of research effort and type of evidence assessing the response of subtropical corals and coral reefs to climate change can provide a valuable insight into global patterns in research effort, and identify critical knowledge gaps that will impact our ability to predict and respond to future changes in subtropical coral reefs. Here a systematic map protocol is applied to identify research efforts from 2010 to 2023 and highlight patterns in the type, scale, and location of research conducted and the availability of data reported.

Methods.

Primary literature within Scopus and Web of Science databases are identified and extracted. The methodologies outlined in a previously published systematic map protocol were applied, and 91 primary research publications were identified for data extraction. Data extraction included bibliometric data, discipline and type of research, type of data reported and how it was recorded, and data availability.

Findings.

The identified literature consisted primarily of experimental studies (46%) and observational studies (38%). The majority of the primary literature investigated the corals in the ecoregion of Southern China (13%), Western Mediterranean (10%) and a total of seven ecoregions within the Oceania continent (29%). Stressors reported as drivers of ocean warming are identified to reflect standardisation of event reporting in literature. An increase in the use of standardised metrics such as degree heating week (DHW) and marine heatwave (MHW) particularly in Australia are reported. Finally, the need for research in regions such as the Western Indian Ocean are also highlighted, where studies on these systems are lagging behind their counterparts in other subtropical ecoregions.

Conclusions.

Increasing ocean temperature and its effects on subtropical and temperate coral reefs are of increasing concern to policy makers and researchers. This systematic map provides a broad overview of research effort, topics and identifies areas where research efforts should be focused. It identified the major research clusters in Asia, Australia, Mediterranean, and North America, gaps of research in regions such as East Indian Oceans, and research efforts on the topic around the globe since 2010.

Keywords: Coral; Coral Reefs; Scleractinian; High Latitude; Marginal; Climate Change; DHW; MHW

**Background**

Coral reef ecosystems are amongst the most important ecosystems in the world, providing a habitat for marine biodiversity and socio-economic benefits to communities that rely on the resources provided by coral reefs [1]. However, the condition of coral reefs have been measured as declining globally under the effects of climate change [2, 3] threatening the biodiversity of marine environments, and even leading to local extinction of species [4]. In tropical coral reefs, records of climate change have shown related declines in number of species, highlighting the consequences of degradation of coral reefs [5]. These issues are therefore pressing and researchers around the world have put in significant efforts to identify the issues and address the topic with the public to increase awareness [6]. Despite these efforts, tropical coral reef conditions around the world continue to decline [7, 8]. The continued increase in ocean temperature causes bleaching and mortality in tropical reefs and the expansion of tropical coral species into subtropical regions [9, 10]. In 2010, bleaching events on subtropical coral reefs in Hong Kong [11, 12] and Japan [65] indicated that ocean warming is also affecting subtropical marine ecosystems. These bleaching events in recent decades reflect the need to assess the conditions of subtropical coral reefs to conserve them. The subtropical coral reefs differ from tropical coral reefs in terms of variety of species and environment [13], whilst also serving as habitat to a variety of subtropical and tropical marine organisms, including a number of endemic taxa [14]. Moreover, studies have also reviewed the capability of these coral reefs in subtropical regions to become refugia for tropical species under in the marginal areas [15]. This leads to a new influx of research into the topic, and more resources and efforts are put into the conservation of subtropical coral reefs.

Despite the efforts of research on the conservation of subtropical coral reefs, there are contradictions between studies on the hypotheses for the future role and impacts to these ecosystems, from refuge from climate change [16, 17], poleward expansion of tropical species [17, 18], and decline and loss of endemism of regions [19]. For example, the conditions for a site to become a refugia depend largely on the oceanographic properties of its surrounding water where studies have reported the importance of upwelling in the water column to the long-term stable state of domination by thermally susceptible coral genera on the forereef of the subtropical atoll by decreasing the temperature of water [15, 16]. However, the upwelling of the water column will only provide refuge if there is synchrony between ocean warming and upwelling [16]. Equally, studies have shown that under climate change herbivorous marine organisms and corals from tropical regions are expanding into subtropical and temperate regions, and these expansions have the potential to alter the community structure of subtropical and temperate regions [17, 20]. This influx of tropical poleward expansion could pose a threat to the subtropical and temperate coral communities, as some key tropical coral species such as *Acropora hyacinthus* and *Acropora muricata* have much higher growth rates than other endemic species in these regions [21]. These endemic taxa may therefore face decline as the result of competition tropical species [17]. The increase in literature investigating the topics introduced an opportunity to compile the evidence currently available to provide a summary of the current state of knowledge on different aspects of the topic.

A systematic map acts as an overview of distribution and abundance of evidence in relation to a broad research topic [22]. They can enable the identification of gaps in research, knowledge clusters, study themes, and methodologies in studies (James et al., 2016). Additionally, analysis of bibliometric data such as citation numbers, publishing information and author collaboration details from published studies provides details of author collaboration networks, which can be used to identify the research specialties, research groups and impact of studies. The insights provided by a systematic map can therefore help direct future research efforts more effectively.

When collating and classifying research evidence, we need to consider factors such as the location of the study, year of publication, study types, and metric used for identifying ocean warming events. Marine Ecoregions of the World (MEOW) (Spalding et al., 2007) introduced a hierarchical biogeoregionalisation of coastal and shelf areas based on biogeographic assessments, ecoregional assessments, government-derived or supported systems and input from different researchers and assessments [23]. Using MEOW as a standardised reference for location enables a systematic approach for recording locational data in marine conservation planning and research, enabling a more robust referencing between studies to identify biogeographical data. In the a;up-to-dateMany methods of recording extreme temperature events are used; most common methods of recording include degree heating weeks (DHW) [27-29] and marine heatwaves (MHW) [30]. Using standardised metrics to assess heating events allows direct comparison between studies. Identifying the literature that utilised these standardised methods will provide insights into the commonality of using DHW and MHW in study of subtropical coral reefs.

**Objective of the Review**

The following questions are outlined in the published protocol [31] to be answered in this systematic map:

What is the evidence, since 2010, within scientific literature on the impact of ocean warming to subtropical and temperate corals and coral reefs?

How has sea surface temperature (SST) data been recorded in subtropical and temperate coral reef locations?

Are the studies using MHW (Marine heatwaves) and/or DHW (degree heating weeks) as their metrics of evaluation of climate events?

How are the levels of mortality and bleaching defined in the research locations?

Where, and how, has coral biological response and coral reef ecological impacts been recorded in subtropical and temperate coral reef locations?

The questions listed above concerns the recording methods of existing literature as well as the distribution of researchers around the world working on the topic. Through answering these questions, the trend of using different temperature data, reporting metrices and publication timeline are identified, providing a summary of recent publications to the users of this report.

**Terminology.**

**Ocean warming.** Ocean warming refers to increase of temperature in oceanic waters.

**Coral.** Members of the Anthozoa orders; Scleractinia, Corallimorpharia, Alcyonacea and Antipatharia which include the true stony corals, soft corals, black corals, etc.

**Coral bleaching.** Coral bleaching occurs when the water that the coral system lives in becomes warmer than the temperature threshold of the coral, causing coral to expel the symbiont zooxanthellae, leaving a white coral skeleton.

**Coral populations.** Mixed and single species populations of coral within an ecosystem.

**Coral reef ecosystem.** Coral dominated ecosystem.

**Coral reef refugia.** Coral reef refugia are areas where the physical, biological, and ecological characteristics allow for a potential habitat for corals in the rising tide of climate change [38].

**Degree Heating Weeks.** Degree heating weeks (DHWs) is a measure of accumulated thermal stress experienced by corals. It is calculated by adding up days where temperatures exceed the usual summertime maximum by at least 1 degree Celsius over a 12-week period [39].

**Ecoregions.**

**High latitude reef.** Reefs that are in regions above and below 28°N and 28°S respectively [40]. As referred in Beger et al. [41] work and the henceforth figure and table. (Figure S1. And Table. S4, see appendix)

**Marine Heat Wave.** Marine heat wave (MHW) is calculated from long-term sea surface temperature (SST) data obtained by satellite, in-situ instruments, or other means of observed data collection. It is defined as thermal events where SST exceeds the 90th percentile of the climatological dataset for at least 5 consecutive days [30].

**Marine Protected Areas.** Maine Protected Areas (MPAs) are identified, herein MPAs are defined as areas with a clearly defined geographical space, recognised, dedicated, and managed through legal or other means to maintain the long-term conservation of ecosystems and cultural values associated with the location [67].

**Marginal reef.** Marginal reefs are where the environmental conditions are marginal or close to threshold for the survival of the coral species, meaning that the living conditions are less than ideal but still feasible for coral species to survive (Kleypas et al., 1999)

**PECO.** (P)opulation, (E)xposure (C)omparator and (O)bjective. It is a framework used to define a problem statement in environmental studies, originally used in medicinal studies.

**Primary literature.** These are literatures where original results from the authors were reported in the form of a report of their findings.

**Provinces.** Defined by Spalding et al. (2007) [23] as large areas with presence of distinct biotas, that hold some level of endemism.

**Sea Surface Temperature.** Sea surface temperature (SST) is the measure of the surface temperature of ocean.

**Secondary literature.** These are literatures that the authors integrate information of primary literature into a separate document, such as a review.

**Subtropical.** The region surrounding the tropical regions. However, in this work the subtropical ecoregions are defined as in Figure 1 and Table S1 (See appendix) (Spalding et al., 2007; Beger et al., 2013) and interchangeable with high latitude reefs.

**Systematic map.** Methodical overviews of the quantity and quality of evidence in relation to an open question of policy or management relevance [37].

**Temperate.** The region surrounding the subtropical regions. However, in this work the temperate ecoregions are defined as in Figure 3 (Beger et al., 2013).

**Tropicalisation.** Tropicalisation refers to a region outside the tropical latitudes increasing in number of warm-affinity species and decreasing in number of cool-water species [20].

**Methods**

**Protocol**

We followed the Collaboration for Environmental Evidence Guidelines and Standards for Evidence Synthesis in Environmental Management [37] and conformed to the reporting standards for systematic evidence synthesis (ROSES) [42]. The systematic map is based on a previously published protocol registered in PROCEED, the global database of prospectively registered evidence reviews and syntheses in the environmental sector [31].

**Deviation from the protocol**

There was no deviation from the protocol.

**Search strategy**

10 benchmark articles were selected a priori for the development of the search string. These 10 articles were selected based on their relevance to the topic, covering both climatology, and subtropical and temperate coral systems under the influence of ocean warming. A series of search string were trialed to test their capability on capturing the benchmark articles. The Boolean operator search string was developed on Scopus and translated to the Web of Science database after it successfully captured all 10 benchmark articles on Scopus. To capture recent studies, the search results were limited to publication on and after 2010 and limited to English only.

**Search strings**

**Bibliographic databases**

Scopus: TITLE-ABS-KEY ( ( coral\* OR “coral reef\*” ) ) AND TITLE-ABS-KEY ( ( “ocean warming” OR “marine heatwave\*” OR “marine heat wave\*” OR mhw\* OR “degree heating week\*” OR dhw\* OR “heat stress\*” OR stress OR tropicali?ation OR temperature\* OR “climate change” ) ) AND TITLEABS- KEY ( ( mortal\* OR surviv\* OR health\* OR diseas\* OR grow\* OR reprodu\* OR cover\* OR tropicali?\* OR shift\* OR habitat\* OR increase\* OR declin\* OR decreas\* OR impact\* OR threat\* OR bleach\* OR acclimati?\* OR respons\* ) ) AND TITLE-ABS-KEY ( ( marginal OR “high latitude” OR temperate OR subtropic\* OR extratropic\* ) ) Followed by a removal of articles published prior to 2010.

Web of Science: (All Fields) ( ( coral\* OR “coral reef\*” ) ) AND (All Fields) ( ( “ocean warming” OR “marine heatwave\*” OR “marine heat wave\*” OR mhw\* OR “degree heating week\*” OR dhw\* OR “heat stress\*” OR stress OR tropicali?ation OR temperature\* OR “climate change” ) ) AND (All Fields) ( ( mortal\* OR surviv\* OR health\* OR diseas\* OR grow\* OR reprodu\* OR cover\* OR tropicali?\* OR shift\* OR habitat\* OR increase\* OR declin\* OR decreas\* OR impact\* OR threat\* OR bleach\* OR acclimati?\* OR respons\* ) ) AND (All Fields) ( ( marginal OR “high latitude” OR temperate OR subtropic\* OR extratropic\* ) ) Followed by removal of articles published prior to 2010.

**Web-based search engines**

Grey literature was searched on Open Access Theses and Dissertations (OATD) database, with the following search string used, which in pilot testing has yielded 8 results: coral AND (subtropical OR temperate) AND "ocean warming" The included results were limited to articles and reports published since 2010 to cohere with the rest of the searches. Grey literature included was limited to research theses, pre-review reports, and open access scientific studies (herein defined as grey literature selected for inclusion in systematic mapping) while government reports were excluded due to the inconsistency in availability of these reports between regions.

**Comprehensiveness of the search**

All 10 manually collected benchmark articles were returned in the Scopus search, ensuring the search string to be sensitive enough for this systematic mapping study. The list of the 10 benchmark articles are found in Additional file 1.

**Screening strategy**

The first screening was conducted including and excluding articles by titles and abstracts using Rayyan software (Ouzzani et al., 2016) and was undertaken by two reviewers independently on 1218 titles and abstracts. Articles included in the first round of screening were screened again in the second phase of the screening by full text. Where full text did not meet the selection criteria, they were excluded from the data extraction. A pilot screening was performed by two of the authors to assess the coherence of articles screening agreement by Cohen’s Kappa coefficients [43, 44]. Articles on Rayyan were selected at random for reviewers to quickly screen through the titles and abstracts (30/1218, 24.6%). Articles with uncertainty in decisions were flagged for a third independent reviewer (TDA) for final decision. Consistency checks were performed for both stages on 30 titles and abstracts (Kappa = 0.61). Full text data inclusion and exclusion were cross checked by the author (MLH) to ensure that all data extracted are coherent to the inclusion criteria.

**Eligibility criteria**

Articles from the databases were screened manually according to the following PECO criteria:

Population: Subtropical and Temperate Coral Systems and Coral Reefs

* All subtropical and temperate coral systems and coral reefs were included; this includes marginal and high latitude coral systems.
* Studies focused solely on tropical, polar and/or deep sea corals, kelp forests and fishes were excluded.

Exposure: Ocean Warming

* We included studies focused on the effects of exposure to ocean warming, specifically empirical ocean warming studies that utilise degree heating weeks and the definition of marine heatwaves as defined by Hobday et al. (2016) [30], meaning cases where:
  + SST exceeds the bleaching threshold of 4 degrees Celsius.
  + SST exceeds the 90th percentile of the ongoing and continuous 30 years climatological data, subjected to 30 days moving window [30].
* Studies focused on ocean acidification and its interaction with ocean warming were excluded from this systematic map.

Comparator: Effects before and after recorded event/exposure.

Outcomes: Mortality and bleaching, habitat changes, threats, acclimatisation of subtropical and temperate coral systems.

* We included all studies that address the physiological effects and ecological effects ocean warming have on the coral systems and reefs – this includes mortality, bleaching, changes in habitats (e.g., destruction of reef structures), threats (e.g., increase in species that pose threats to corals and coral reefs). Topics addressing the acclimatisation of species were also considered.

**Reporting screening outcomes**

During the full-text screening, studies that were rejected from the process were recorded with the respective reasons recorded. A flow diagram has been used to record and visualise the number of studies assessed and rejected at each stage.

**Study validity assessment.**

No study validity assessment of studies has been performed for this systematic map.

**Data coding strategy**

Data extraction was done collaboratively by 6 reviewers using a questionnaire from the articles included in the full text screening. The following categories of variables were extracted and described in a spreadsheet (Additional file 2):

* Bibliographic map (Title, DOI, number of citations, authors’ information, year of publication, journal, keywords)
* Location of research (Research ecoregions, type of location, development status, species)
* Research data recorded (Temperature data recording methods, study type, study timeline, environmental parameters, availability of temperature data)
* Ocean warming evidence (Extreme weather events recorded, stressors, severity, extreme weather events timeline, study outcome or prediction)

**Demonstrating procedural independence**

As some of the authors of this proposed review may have been authors of some of the studies to be reviewed in this work, their studies will be independently assessed by other reviewers without discussion with the study authors to ensure the independence of the review.

**Reporting**. Methods outlined in previously published protocol were followed, apart from minor additions and deviations described in the section “Deviation, additions and justifications”.

The ROSES Reporting Standard for the reports of findings from the systematic map was applied [42]. MLH used the search strings registered in the published protocol for Scopus and Web of Science respectively; 877 results returned from Scopus, 1042 results returned from Web of Science, and 9 results from Open Access Theses and Dissertations. MLH and PS independently screened 1227 unique papers by title, abstract and keywords. The screening resulted in 187 unique papers for full-text screening. MLH, PS, CP, SV, JW and SE coordinated on screening full-text obtained from the 187 unique papers, and yielded 91 unique papers for data extraction (Figure 1). Titles of excluded articles from full-text screening are provided in Supplementary Table S1.

We extracted 51 separate variables related to the primary and secondary questions as outlined in the published protocol [31]. These variables include bibliometric information, methodology, reporting, etc. For the ease of reporting, our results are divided into two parts: the first part is a systematic map characterising included studies in terms of investigated drivers of ocean warming, severity of ocean warming, location, and method of research, and the second part is bibliometric map (i.e. Authors’ information, publication data, etc.). During the data extraction from full text, variables including availability of temperature data of studies, and bibliometric parameters such as number of citations, number of co-authors and journal of publications were included.

All figures on this systematic map were created using R version 4.2.2 [45] on R Studio version 2023.06.0 [46], as well as RAWGraphs [47]. Several packages in R were used in the creation of figures, including ggplot2 [48], wordcloud [49], wordcloud2 [50], tidyverse [51], dplyr [52], reshape2 [53], viridis [54], RColorBrewer [55], leaflet [56], htmlwidgets [57], webshot [58], and tm [59]. Organisation of plots into multi-panel figures were done with the use of Adobe Illustrator.

**Review findings**

**Data characteristics**. From the 1236 initially identified studies, 91 studies met the inclusion criteria for the purpose of this systematic map (Figure 1). All 91 studies provided data for the formulation of the systematic map and bibliometric map.

**Study types.** 44 studies are identified (48.4%) that are observational based, three studies (3.3%) include both observational and modelling evidence. 35 studies (38.5%) identified as experimental, with 7 studies (7.7%) include both experimental and observational evidence and one study (1.1%) include both experimental and modelling evidence. One study (1.1%) identified as solely modelling based. The keywords used for each study were extracted. The top three used keywords for included studies were “coral”, “change coral” and “bleaching coral” respectively and provide a word cloud of all key words (Figure 2a).

**Bibliometric map**. Increasing research effort from 2013 to 2015 is reported (a total of 19 publications during 2013- 2015) following by a drop to four publications 2016 and increase to nine publications in 2017 (Figure 2b) and has reached a peak of now 10 publications per year in each of 2022 and Mid-2023. In terms of number of citations, two studies stood out, having 510 citations (study by Yamano et al., 2011 [17]) and 159 citations (study by Le Nohaïc et al., 2017 [60]), respectively. Overall publications included in this systematic map are less cited (Median = 20) (Figure 4a). Authors with more than one publication are associated with institutions in Hong Kong (three authors), Australia (one author), United States of America (one author), United Kingdom (one author), Italy (one author), Taiwan (one author), Spain (one author), New Zealand (one author), and Monaco (one author). Most authors publishing only intermittently (Figure 5). In terms of publication journals, the largest number of studies included come from Coral Reefs (17 studies), followed by Frontiers in Marine Science (seven studies), Scientific Reports (six studies) (Figure 4b). Other journals include Science of the Total Environment (four studies), Diversity (three studies), Global Change Biology (three studies), Marine Ecology Progress Series (three studies), Marine Pollution Bulletin (three studies), PloS One (three studies), Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences (three studies), Bulletin of Marine Science (two studies), Ecology and Evolution (two studies), Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology (two studies), Limnology and Oceanography (two studies), Molecular Ecology (two studies) (Table 1 with all included articles freely/openly available).

**Location of research.**

The provinces were identified, and subsequently the ecoregion where the included studies were conducted (Figure 7). Majority of studies were conducted in the province of South China Sea (20 occurrences), this includes the ecoregions of Southern China (15 studies), South China Sea Oceanic Islands (one study), and Gulf of Tonkin (four studies). The second highest province is Mediterranean Sea, consisting of 15 occurrences, including the ecoregions of Western Mediterranean (11 studies), Adriatic Sea (two studies), Levantine Sea (one study), and Ionian Sea (one study). The province of Warm Temperate Northwest Pacific was the third highest occurring province, with 12 occurrences of studies identified in the ecoregions of East China Sea (six studies), Central Kuroshio Current (six studies) (Figure 7b).

When examining the provinces recorded from the included studies, seven provinces that are on the Australian continent were identified, including Lord Howe and Norfolk Islands (nine occurrences), Southwest Australian Shelf (six occurrences), West Central Australian Shelf (five occurrences), East Central Australian Shelf (four occurrences), Northeast Australian Shelf (three occurrences), Southeast Australian Shelf (two occurrences) and Northwest Australian Shelf (one occurrence). These provinces include the ecoregions of Lord Howe and Norfolk Island (nine studies), Leeuwin (six studies), Houtman (five studies), Tweed-Moreton (three studies), Manning-Hawkesbury (one study), Central and Southern Great Barrier Reef (two studies), Torres Strait Northern Great Barrier Reef (one study), Cape Howe (two studies), and Ningaloo (one study) (Figure 7b and Table 2).

Six occurrences were identified for the province of Cold Temperate Northwest Atlantic. The ecoregion included is Gulf of Maine/Bay of Fundy (six studies). Tropical Southwestern Atlantic and Warm Temperate Northwest Atlantic recorded four occurrences each, within the ecoregions of Eastern Brazil (two studies), North-eastern Brazil (two studies), Carolinian (three studies), and Northern Gulf of Mexico (one study). Tropical North-western Atlantic and Warm Temperate Southwestern Atlantic each has two occurrences. The ecoregions under these two provinces, Floridian and South-eastern Brazil, respectively, have two studies each recorded.

The province of Somali/Arabian has three occurrences, the included ecoregion is Arabian (Persian) Gulf (three studies). Similarly, the province of Lusitanian also recorded three occurrences, in the ecoregion of Azores Canaries Madeira (two studies) and South European Atlantic Shelf (one study). Remaining recorded provinces are Western Indian Ocean (two occurrences) with the ecoregions of Mascarene Islands (one study) and Delagoa (one study); Agulhas (one occurrence) with the ecoregion Natal (one study), and South Kuroshio (one occurrence), with one study in the ecoregion South Kuroshio.

Within the included studies, majority (58 studies) of the study were conducted in regions of developed economies (United Nations Country Classification, accessed 2024), with Australia (23 studies) having the highest number of studies published within the category. This is followed by United States of America (12 studies) and Japan (seven studies). Within the category of developed economies, one study has also included an economy in transition (defined as industrialised countries that are undergoing process of transition to a market economy. These include some former Soviet Union republics [61].). Another study also encompasses a developed economy and developing economy (defined as countries with less developed industrial base and lower human development index in relative to other countries [62]). For developing economies (31 studies), Hong Kong has the highest number of published studies (11 studies), followed by China (5 studies) and Brazil (5 studies).

For proximity of the research site to the mainland (Figure 8a), most studies involve close/territorial sea (69 studies). Studies in middle/contiguous zone are recorded in seven studies. Far/exclusive economic zone are recorded in 15 studies. Of all the studies involving close/territorial sea, four studies also involve middle/contiguous zone, two studies involve far/exclusive economic zone, and two studies involve both middle/contiguous and far/exclusive economic zone. 10 studies did not specify their proximity to the mainland (Figure 8a) and 21 of the studies took place in protected areas (Figure 8b). A list of the protected areas can be found in Table 3.

**Methodological approaches.**

***Temperature Data Record*.** When examining the methods reported by the study authors for obtaining ocean temperature records, 50 publications were found to have obtained their temperature data *in-situ* (deployment of loggers), 28 studies used remote sensing data (herein referred to satellite derived and SST, sea surface temperature) for temperature data. 26 studies used other methods of obtaining temperature data, these are *ex-situ* conservation (where temperature was set to match the experimental criteria) (24 studies) or not identified (two studies) in the literature (Figure 9a). For *in-situ* collected data were collected using temperature logger (26 studies), dive computers (two studies), NOAA National Buoy Center (two studies), remotely operated vehicles (ROV) (two studies), digital thermometer (one study), mercury thermometer (one study), local monitoring sites (one study), and T-MEDNet as a temperature data sharing site (one study) (Figure 9b). 13 studies did not specify the method of recording temperature data. For temperature data availability, 51 of the 91 studies did not provide raw temperature data for access, with the remaining 40 studies providing full access to raw temperature data (see Supplementary Table S2).

***Study depth*.** For study depth and/or depth of data collection, majority of temperature data were obtained at depth of 20m below sea surface (Figure 9c), with one temperature data recording at a depth of 40m (T-MEDNet). The highest occurrence of depth for temperature collection is 3m (eight occurrences), followed by 4m (seven occurrences) and 2m (five occurrences).

***Type of study*.** 17 studies of the 91 studies included are reported to have taken place concurrently with extreme weather or climate events (Figure 10a and Table 4) and focused on reporting evidence associated with the specific event occurring, while two further studies report extreme weather events but were not conducted concurrently with the events. Majority of studies (72 studies) were not describing any specific extreme weather events.

***Other environmental data*.** From the included studies, most observed environmental parameters (Figure 10b) are light (13 studies), salinity (12 studies) and pH values (nine studies), while other parameters include nutrients (eight studies), ocean current (six studies), chlorophyll a concentration (five studies), wind speed (one study), water quality (one study), mean-sea bottom temperature (one study), CO2 concentration (one study), chlorophyll c concentration (one study), boron isotopic composition of sea water (one study), and bathymetry (one study).

***Study species.*** For coral species studied, Scleractinian is reported to be the most dominant studied coral order (124 species studied), followed by Alcyonacea (seven species), Zoantharia (five species), Actiniaria (three species), Anthoathecata (two species), Axinellida (two species), Laminariales (two species), Agelasida (one species), Aplousobranchia (one species), Dictyoceratida (one species), Haplosclerida (one species), Pennatulacea (one species), Poecilosclerida (one species), and Suessiales (one species) (Figure 4a). Within the order Scleractinian, *Murilinidae* (48 occurrences) was found to be the most studied family of coral species, followed by Acroporidae (42 occurrences) (Figure 11). Species level information can be found in Supplementary Table S3,

**Ocean Warming Evidence**

69 studies provided an outcome (defined here as studies presenting results and conclusion based on their research efforts) associated with the study conclusion, while 13 studies provided prediction (defined here as studies providing a prediction of future scenarios based on results presented in their research) in their conclusion, and the remaining nine studies provided both outcome and prediction (Figure 12a). From the outcomes and predictions, most studies focus on reporting on physiology of coral systems under thermal stress (34 studies), followed by investigations into adaptation of coral species into marginal reefs (16 studies), changes in coral populations (12 studies), calcification of reefs (eight studies), assessment of potential refugia (six studies), recovery of population (five studies), climate change projections (two studies), impact of cold stress on coral (two studies), seasonal changes (two studies), and ENSO interactions (one study) (Figure 12b).

***Drivers*.** Most studies focused on using long-term climate change as a driver of ocean warming (47 papers, 51.6%). This is followed by use of experimental stressors such as artificially heightening temperature and acute thermal stress treatments (20 papers, 22.0%). Degree heating weeks made up the third most recorded stressor indicator (11 papers, 12.1%) of ocean warming and marine heatwaves (Hobday et al., 2016) being the fourth (eight papers, 8.8%). The other stressors include seasonal variation (four papers, 4.4%), localised hotspots (two papers, 2.2%), cold stress (two papers, 2.2%), El Nino Southern Oscillation (one paper, 1.1%), tidal temperature change (one paper, 1.1%), and temperature difference along latitudes (one paper, 1.1%). Two papers (2.2%) did not specify the stressor used when describing bleaching events (Figure 13a).

***Severity*.** 17 papers (18.7%) reported degree heating weeks, marine heatwaves, or both as identifiers of the severity of ocean warming (Figure 13b), 6 papers did not specify the intensity of marine heatwaves, 1 paper recorded a moderate and a strong marine heatwave event, and 1 paper recorded a severe marine heatwave event. For studies reporting degree heating weeks as recording matrix, 5 papers did not specify the level of bleaching alert. 2 separate papers recorded bleaching events exceeding bleaching alert level 5 (>20 DHW), another two papers recorded bleaching events exceeding bleaching alert level 4 (>16 DHW). Bleaching alert level 3 (>12 DHW) was reported in 1 paper, while bleaching alert level 2 (>8 DHW) was not reported in the papers. 3 bleaching alert level 1 (>4 DHW) were reported in 2 separate papers, and 3 bleaching warnings (1 to 4 DHW) were reported in 1 paper (Figure 13b).

**Limitation of the map**

**Limitations of the mapping process.** While a comprehensive search strategy was developed and employed for this systematic map, it is essential to acknowledge the omission of relevant studies may have occurred, as the search string developed for this systematic map comprised of a combination of general and specific terms relevant to the topic. Our search string initially returned with a large number of non-relevant literature, as we intended to capture as many relevant literatures as possible. Including more specific terms for future searches on database may assist in capturing a boarder spectrum of articles. Despite that, we believe our search string has successfully captured a board spectrum of articles available, enabling the mapping of evidence base.

**Conclusions.** In systematic mapping of the literature, we found that research effort on climate change in subtropical ecosystems has increased over the past two decades, with most evidence now available from the period 2020-2024. Research has focused on three main provinces in Asia Pacific and Mediterranean Sea, and seven provinces in Australia. Studies have predominately been led by researchers associated with developed nation institutions (61.5% of studies). Research has predominantly investigated the impact of climate change to corals within the orders Scleractinian and Alcyonacea. 12.1 % of researchers were found to have reported on climate events using the DHW (degree heating weeks metric) with 8.8% reporting on events applying the MHW metric (marine heat wave). While research effort for the impacts of climate change on subtropical corals and coral reefs has lagged behind that of tropical regions, evidence on impact and responses of subtropical systems is increasingly rapidly. This apparent increase in evidence-base for the subtropics is likely be aligned with records of severe (or extreme) climate and weather events now impacting these regions, with 18.7% of the identified research coming from studies reporting during events associated with ecological scale events such as coral bleaching, kelp losses, seagrass losses and anomalously high sea surface temperatures.

***Study type and timeline of evidence.*** We find that a majority of studies (50 studies) are observational or have components of observational (defined here as studies that collect data by observing the subjects in their natural settings) (59.3% of studies), were associated with recorded extreme/severe climate events. Other help were experimental studies as the second most prevalent study type (47.3%). There is no apparent shift in dominance of experimental (29 out of 61, 47.5% of studies between 2010-2020) or observational (39 out of 61, 62.9% of studies between 2010-2020) studies reported before 2020, with both types of study being published at a similar rate throughout those years. However, from 2020 onwards, the number of observational studies (17 out of 30, 56.7% after 2020) began to level out with experimental studies (12 out of 30, 40% of studies) for evidence reports.

In early 2010s, the number of publications identified investigating climate change impacts on subtropical reefs (or corals) was relatively low, ranging from 1 to 2 studies a year until 2014. A drastic increase in number of publications by 50% was then apparent from 2015 as research efforts begin to increase. To increase attention to the topic, Beger et al., (2014) published a review highlighting the need for preserving high latitude coral reef systems and the potential impacts of climate change. Additionally, 2014 to 2017 saw an unprecedented period of severe sea surface temperature, and the longest recorded bleaching events for coral reef ecosystems which was associated high mortality in coral reefs [63]. Increasing awareness of, and observations of, climate change impact on subtropical coral reefs likely contributed significantly to the increase in research efforts into the subtropical reefs post 2014. The number of publications continued over the past 5 years showing a steady research effort being undertaken in the subtropical coral reefs, with now a near annual publication rate of 10 publications per year (2022, 2023).

***Ecoregions, provinces and sources of climate change impacts evidence.*** Research efforts for subtropical coral research and subsequently evidence for the impact of climate change in these ecosystems has predominantly focused on ecoregions in the Asian Pacific region. Specifically, the ecoregions of the provinces South China Sea, Andaman, Warm Temperate Northwest Pacific, and South Kuroshio are sites where research effort has been intensive (a total of 27 publications). Research in these sites were primarily published on and after 2015, associated with coral bleaching events reported in 2014 in Hong Kong [11], 2016 in Andaman Sea [64] and 2016 in Japan [65]. Therefore, ecoregions are also identified where there are research gaps and evidence for the impact of climate change has remined low, such as Delagoa, Mascarene Islands, Arabian Gulf, Natal, etc. While these ecoregions are directly exposed to the Western Indian Ocean, there is evidence of bleaching events in the area [66]. In this systematic map, studies where research effort has been associated with recorded marine protected areas were identified. Most marine park/reserve literature is reported from Australia. Only 23.1% (21 out of 91) of the studies reported having conducted research in protected or associated with marine protected areas and 35.2% of studies (32 out of 91) did not clearly indicate if their published studies took place in or within the region of a marine protected area. Given the recent increases in areas designated MPAs or marine parks internationally [68], future research identifying patterns of research effort, knowledge gaps and evidence synthesis for coral reef ecosystems should consider further investigating the sites within marine protected areas to build evidence-base for park management.

***Drivers and Severity of Ocean Warming****.* Prior to 2016, most studies report long-term climate change as an environmental driver for ocean warming. The use of long-term monitoring data was common for studies, and the research using this as an approach to study drivers of ocean warming generally investigate coral calcification and adaptation to marginal reefs to examine the effect of ocean warming on coral health and habitats. The introduction of a hierarchical approach developed to defining marine heatwaves through 30 years of temperature record of the regions [30] sees the increase in use of marine heatwaves as a tool for identifying potential bleaching events [69, 70]. Use of degree heating weeks for subtropical corals was uncommon until 2017, when an increased number of publications used degree heating week as a reporting mechanism on bleaching of subtropical coral [60, 71, 72] was observed. This allowed the authors of respective studies to use standardised metrics to compare the severity of bleaching on subtropical reefs to tropical reefs. A combined use of both marine heatwave and degree heating week as reporting mechanisms may benefit future studies in quantitatively comparing data between sites and events.

The use of marine heatwave and degree heating weeks provide researchers with the quantitative metric of severity of an ocean warming event and/or bleaching event. We find an increase in the severity of degree heating weeks and marine heatwaves reported, with publications finding high levels of bleaching alerts [73-75], strong [76] and severe [77] marine heatwaves was found. A combined use of both marine heatwave and degree heating week as reporting mechanisms may benefit future studies in quantitatively comparing severity between sites and events.

**Implications for research.** Research globally has primarily focused on reporting ecological responses to climate change associated events however substantial effort has also been directed to experimental studies. Physiological data is one of the most common forms of impact, and data was reported in the studies, with 30% of the identified literature reporting on the physiological state of corals associated with climate impacts in subtropical regions. Future research in this area should consider a meta-analysis of the evidence identified in the current study. In particular, the assessment of the severity of thermal stress events shows evidence for severe bleaching events recorded from 2010-2023 occurring within the mortality scale of impact (degree heating week of 8 or above). Understanding the severity of thermal stress reports across subtropical regions will aid managers in predicting and responding to the impact of bleaching on these reefs. Ongoing systematic assessment of research effort and evidence provided will also provide managers with reliable, transparent, and comparable assessment of evidence as it continues to develop and allow for the evidence-based management practices specific to these unique and valuable ecosystems.

**Declarations**

**Ethics approval and consent to participate**

Not applicable.

**Consent for publication**

Not applicable.

**Availability of data and materials**

The datasets generated and/or analysed during the current study are available in the GitHub repository, <https://github.com/MLH95/Ho-et-al-2024_Systematic-Map>

**Competing interests**

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

**Funding**

Funding in support of this research is provided by UNSW Scientia Program to TDA and research contracts with Parks Australia to TDA, WPL, TG.

**Authors’ contributions**

Publication Authors: Ho, M.L. 1, Leggat WP2, , Gaston T, Nakagawa, S Perkins-Kirkpatrick S, Hobday A, Richards Z Page C.E. 1,Sawyers P , Lagisz, M & Ainsworth T.D2.

MLH and TDA conceptualised the idea for this study. MLH, TDA, PS and CP designed the data extraction methods, as well as validating the design. MLH and PS screened the original database of articles by title and abstract, and later screening was done collaboratively by MLH, PS, CP, SV, JW and SE. Data analysis was performed by MLH. MLH led the writing of the report with crucial contribution from TDA. All authors give their permission for publication of this systematic map in its final form.

**Acknowledgement**

MLH recognises the support provided by TDA, WL, PS, CP, SV, JW, SE on their assistance on extracting data from the list of articles included for full-text screening. MLH also recognises the guidance of ML, SN, TG on the creation of the protocol.

**References**

James KL, Randall NP, Haddaway NR. A methodology for systematic mapping in environmental sciences. Environmental Evidence. 2016;5:7. DOI: 10.1186/s13750-016-0059-6.

Kleypas JA, McManus JW, Meñez LAB. Environmental Limits to Coral Reef Development: Where Do We Draw the Line? ICB. 1999;39:1:146-159. DOI: 10.1093/icb/39.1.146

Ouzzani M, Hammady H, Fedorowicz Z, Elmagarmid A. Rayyan – a web and mobile app for systematic reviews. Systematic Reviews. 2016;5:210. DOI: 10.1186/s13643-016-0384-4.

[1] Moberg F, Folke C. Ecological goods and services of coral reef ecosystems. Ecol. Econ. 1999;29(2):215-233. DOI: 10.1016/S0921-8009(99)00009-9.

[2] Hughes TP, Baird AH, Bellwood DR, et al. Climate Change, Human Impacts, and the Resilience of Coral Reefs. Science. 2003;301(5635):929-933. DOI: 10.1126/science.1085046.

[3] Hoegh-Guldberg O, Mumby PJ, Hooten AJ, et al. Coral Reefs Under Rapid Climate Change and Ocean Acidification. Science. 2007;318(5857):1737-1742. DOI: 10.1126/science.1152509.

[4] Jones GP, McCormick MI, Srinivasan M, Eagle JV. Coral decline threatens fish biodiversity in marine reserves. PNAS. 2004;101(21):8251-8253. DOI: 10.1073/pnas.0401277101.

[5] Pandolfi JM, Bradbury RH, Sala E, et al. Global Trajectories of the Long-Term Decline of Coral Reef Ecosystems. Science. 2003;301(5635):955-958. DOI: 10.1126/science.1085706.

[6] Bellwood DR, Hughes TP, Folke C, Nyström M. Confronting the coral reef crisis. Nature. 2004;429(6994):827-833. DOI: 10.1038/nature02691.

[7] Burt JA, Al-Khalifa K, Khalaf E, et al. The continuing decline of coral reefs in Bahrain. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 2012;72(2):357-363. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2012.08.022.

[8] Eddy TD, Lam VWY, Reygondeau G, et al. Global decline in capacity of coral reefs to provide ecosystem services. One Earth. 2021;4:1278-1285. DOI: 10.1016/j.oneear.2021.08.016.

[9] Hughes TP, Kerry JT, Álvarez-Noriega M, et al. Global warming and recurrent mass bleaching of corals. Nature. 2017;543:373-377. DOI: 10.1038/nature21707.

[10] Bleuel J, Pennino MG, Longo GO. Coral distribution and bleaching vulnerability areas in Southwestern Atlantic under ocean warming. Sci. Rep. 2021;11:12833. DOI: 10.1038/s41598-021-92202-2.

[11] Xie JY, Lau DCC, Yu VPF, Chow WK, Qiu JW. The 2014 summer coral bleaching event in subtropical Hong Kong. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 2017;124(2):653-659. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2017.03.061.

[12] Ip JCH, Zhang Y, Xie JY, Yeung YH, Qiu JW. Stable Symbiodiniaceae composition in three coral species during the 2017 natural bleaching event in subtropical Hong Kong. Mar. Pollut. Bull. 2022;184:114224. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2022.114224.

[13] Chong F, Sommer B, Stant G, et al. High-latitude marginal reefs support fewer but bigger corals than their tropical counterparts. Ecography. 2023;12:e06835. DOI: 10.1111/ecog.06835.

[14] Samayoa AP, Aguirre JD, Delrieu-Trottin R, Liggins L. The origins of marine fishes endemic to subtropical islands of the Southwest Pacific. J. Biogeogr. 2023;50(8):1388-1401. DOI: 10.1111/jbi.14579.

[15] Tkachenko KS, Soong K. Dongsha Atoll: A potential thermal refuge for reef-building corals in the South China Sea. Mar. Environ. Res. 2017;127:112-125. DOI: 10.1016/j.marenvres.2017.04.003.

[16] Chollett I, Mumby PJ, Cortés J. Upwelling areas do not guarantee refuge for coral reefs in a warming ocean. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 2010;416:47-56. DOI: 10.3354/meps08775.

[17] Yamano H, Sugihara K, Nomura K. Rapid poleward range expansion of tropical reef corals in response to rising sea surface temperatures. Geophys. Res. Lett.. 2011;38(4). DOI: 10.1029/2010GL046474.

[18] Jones LA, Mannion PD, Farnsworth A, Bragg F, Lunt DJ. Climatic and tectonic drivers shaped the tropical distribution of coral reefs. Nat. Commun. 2022;13:3120. DOI: 10.1038/s41467-022-30793-8.

[19] Lachs L, Sommer B, Cant J, et al. Linking population size structure, heat stress and bleaching responses in a subtropical endemic coral. Coral Reefs. 2021;40:777-790. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-021-02081-2.

[20] Vergés A, Steinberg PD, Hay ME, et al. The tropicalization of temperate marine ecosystems: climate-mediated changes in herbivory and community phase shifts. Proc. R. Soc. B. 2014;281(1789). DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2014.0846.

[21] Veron JEN. Conservation of biodiversity: a critical time for the hermatypic corals of Japan. Coral Reefs. 1992;11(1):13-21. DOI: 10.1007/BF00291930.

[22] Haddaway NR, Macura B, Whaley P, Pullin AS. ROSES Reporting standards for Systematic Evidence Syntheses: pro forma, flow-diagram and descriptive summary of the plan and conduct of environmental systematic reviews and systematic maps. Environmental Evidence. 2018;7:7. DOI: 10.1186/s13750-018-0121-7.

[23] Spalding MD, Fox HE, Allen GR, Davidson N, Ferdaña ZA, et al. Marine Ecoregions of the World: A Bioregionalization of Coastal and Shelf Areas. BioScience. 2007;57(7):573-583. DOI: 10.1641/B570707.

[24] Abdo DA, Bellchambers LM, Evans SN. Turning up the Heat: Increasing Temperature and Coral Bleaching at the High Latitude Coral Reefs of the Houtman Abrolhos Islands. PLoS ONE. 2012;7(8):e43878. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0043878.

[25] Dalton SJ, Carroll AG. Monitoring coral health to determine coral bleaching response at high latitude eastern Australian Reefs: An applied model for a changing climate. Diversity. 2011;3(4):592-610. DOI: 10.3390/d3040592.

[26] Wicks LC, Hill E, Davya SK. The influence of irradiance on tolerance to high and low temperature stress exhibited by Symbiodinium in the coral, Pocillopora damicornis, from the high-latitude reef of Lord Howe Island. L&O. 2010;55(6):2476-2486. DOI: 10.4319/lo.2010.55.6.2476.

[27] Liu G, Skirving WJ, Strong AE. Remote sensing of sea surface temperatures during 2002 barrier reef coral bleaching. Eos, Transactions American Geophysical Union. 2003;84(15):137-141. DOI: 10.1029/2003EO150001.

[28] Liu G, Strong AE, Skirving WJ, Arzayus LF. Overview of NOAA coral reef watch program’s near-real-time satellite global coral bleaching monitoring activities. In: Proceedings of 10th International Coral Reef Symposium, Okinawa. 2006:1783-1793.

[29] Liu G, Rauenzahn JL, Heron SF, et al. NOAA Coral Reef Watch 50 km Satellite Sea Surface Temperature-Based Decision Support System for Coral Bleaching Management. NOAA Technical Report NESDIS 143. 2013.

[30] Hobday AJ, Alexander LV, Perkins SE, et al. A hierarchical approach to defining marine heatwaves. Prog. Oceanogr. 2015;141:227-238. DOI: 10.1016/j.pocean.2015.12.014.

[31] Ho ML, Lagisz M, Nakagawa S, Perkins-Kirkpatrick S, Sawyers P, Leggat B, Gaston T, Hobday A, Richards Z, Ainsworth TD. What is the evidence for the impact of ocean warming on subtropical and temperate corals and coral reefs?: a Systematic Map Protocol. PROCEED Protocol. 2023. DOI: 10.57808/proceed.2023.9.

[32] Kleypas JA, Buddemeier RW, Archer D, et al. Geochemical consequences of increased atmospheric carbon dioxide on coral reefs. Science. 1999;283(5411):118-120. DOI: 10.1126/science.284.5411.118.

[33] Feely RA, Sabine CL, Lee K, Berelson W, Kleypas J, Fabry VJ, et al. Impact of Anthropogenic CO2 on the CaCO3 System in the Oceans. Science. 2004;305(5682):362-366. DOI: 10.1126/science.1097329.

[34] Orr JC, Fabry VJ, Aumont O, et al. Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the twenty-first century and its impact on calcifying organisms. Nature. 2005;437:681-686. DOI: 10.1038/nature04095.

[35] Sabine CL, Feely RA, Gruber N, et al. The Oceanic Sink for Anthropogenic CO2. Science. 2004;305(5682). DOI: 10.1126/science.1097403.

[36] Guinotte JM, Orr J, Cairns S, et al. Will human-induced changes in seawater chemistry alter the distribution of deep-sea scleractinian corals? Front. Ecol. Environ. 2006;4(3):141-146. DOI: 10.1890/1540-9295(2006)004[0141:whcisw]2.0.co;2.

[37] Collaboration for Environmental Evidence. Guidelines and Standards for Evidence synthesis in Environmental Management. Version 5.1 (Pullin AS, Frampton GK, Livoreil B & Petrokofsky G, Eds). 2022. https://environmentalevidence.org/information-for-authors/. Accessed 08 Mar 2024.

[38] Carter AL, Wilson AMW, Bello M, Hoyos-Padilla EM, Inall ME, Ketchum JT, Schurer A, Tudhope AW. Assessing opportunities to support coral reef climate change refugia in MPAs: A case study at the Revillagigedo Archipelago. Mar. Policy. 2020;112:103769. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpol.2019.103769.

[39] Liu G, Heron SF, Mark EC, Muller-Karger FE, Vega-Rodriguez M, Guild LS, de la Cour JL, Geiger EF, Skirving WJ, Burgess TFR, Strong AE, Harris A. Reef-scale thermal stress monitoring of coral ecosystems: New 5-km global products from NOAA coral reef watch. Remote Sensing. 2014;6(11):11579-11606. DOI: 10.3390/rs61111579

[40] Ross CL, Schoepf V, Decarlo TM, McCulloch MT. Mechanisms and seasonal drivers of calcification in the temperate coral turbinaria reniformis at its latitudinal limits. Proc. R. Soc. B. 2018;285(1879). DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2018.0215.

[41] Beger M, Sommer B, Harrison PL, Smith SD, Pandolfi JM. Conserving potential coral reef refuges at high latitudes. Divers. distrib. 2014;20(3):245-257. DOI: 10.1111/ddi.12140.

[42] Haddaway NR, Macura B, Whaley P, Pullin AS. ROSES Flow diagram for Systematic Maps. Version 1.0. Figshare. 2017. DOI: 10.6084/m9.figshare.6085940.v2.

[43] Cohen J. A Coefficient of Agreement for Nominal Scales. Educational and Psychological Measurement. 1960;20(1). DOI: 10.1177/001316446002000104

[44] McHugh ML. Interrater reliability: the kappa statistic. Biochem Med (Zagreb). 2012;22(3):276-282. PMID: 23092060; PMCID: PMC3900052.

[45] R Core Team. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. 2022. https://www.r-project.org/about.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[46] RStudio Team. RStudio: Integrated development environment for R [Internet]. Boston, MA; 2023. http://www.rstudio.com/. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[47] Mauri M, Elli T, Caviglia G, Uboldi G, Azzi M. RAWGraphs: A Visualisation Platform to Create Open Outputs. In: CHItaly '17: Proceedings of the 12th Biannual Conference on Italian SIGCHI Chapter. 2017. p. 1-5. DOI: 10.1145/3125571.3125585.

[48] Wickham H, Chang W, Henry L, Pedersen TL, Takahashi K, Wilke C, Woo K, Yutani H, Dunnington D, Brand TVD, Posit Software, PBC. ggplot2: Create Elegant Data Visualisations Using the Grammar of Graphics. 2024. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/ggplot2/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[49] Fellows, I. Wordcloud: Word Clouds. 2018. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/wordcloud/index.html. Accessed 08 Mar 2024.

[50] Lang D. wordcloud2: Create Word Cloud by ‘htmlwidget’. 2018. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/wordcloud2/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[51] Wickham H, RStudio. tidyverse: Easily Install and Load the 'Tidyverse'. 2023. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/tidyverse/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[52] Wickham H, François R, Henry L, Müller K, Vaughan D, Posit Software, PBC. dplyr: A Grammar of Data Manipulation. 2023. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/dplyr/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[53] Wickham H. reshape2: Flexibly Reshape Data: A Reboot of the Reshape Package. 2020. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/reshape2/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[54] Garnier S, Ross N, Rudis B, Sciaini N, Camargo AP, Scherer C. viridis: Colorblind-Friendly Color Maps for R. 2024. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/viridis/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[55] Neuwrith E. RColorBrewer: ColorBrewer Palettes. 2022. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/RColorBrewer/index.html. Accessed 08 Mar 2024.

[56] Cheng J, Schloerke B, Karambelkar B, Xie Y, Wickham H, Russell K, Johnson K, Agafonkin V, CloudMade (Leaflet library), Leaflet contributors (Leaflet library), Copeland B (leaflet-measure plugin), Dietrich J (Leaflet.Terminator plugin), Becquet B (Leaflet.MagnifyingGlass plugin), Norkart AS (Leaflet.MiniMap plugin), Voogdt L (Leaflet.awesome-markers plugin), Montague D (Leaflet.EasyButton plugin), Kartena AB (Proj4Leaflet plugin), Kajic R (leaflet-locationfilter plugin), Mapbox (leaflet-omnivore plugin), Bostock M (topojson), Posit Software, PBC. leaflet: Create Interactive Web Maps with the JavaS‘ript 'L’aflet' Library. 2024. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/leaflet/index.html. Accessed 09 Apr 2024.

[57] Vaidyanathan R, Xie Y, Allaire JJ, Cheng J, Sievert C, Russell K, Hughes E, Posit Software, PBC. htmlwidgets: HTML Widgets for R. 2023. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/htmlwidgets/index.html. Accessed on 08 Mar 2024.

[58] Chang W, Xie Y, Guillem F, Schloerke B, Perriault N. webshot: Take Screenshots of Web Pages. 2023. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/webshot/index.html. Accessed 08 Mar 2024.

[59] Feinerer I, Hornik K, Artifex Software, Inc. tm: Text Mining Package. 2024. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/tm/index.html. Accessed 09 Apr 2024.

[60] Le Nohaïc M, Ross CL, Cornwall CE, Comeau S, Lowe R, McCulloch MT, Schoepf V. Marine heatwave causes unprecedented regional mass bleaching of thermally resistant corals in northwestern Australia. Sci. Rep. 2017;14999. DOI: 10.1038/s41598-017-14794-y.

[61] United Nations. World Economic Situation and Prospects 2024. 2024. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/dpad/publication/world-economic-situation-and-prospects-2024/> Accessed 08 Mar 2024.

[62] Kammoun S, Romdhane YB, Fakhfakh MBS. Effects of Economic and Political Risks on Foreign Direct Investment: A Panel Data Analysis in MENA Region. In: Regional Trade and Development Strategies in the Era of Globalization. 2020. DOI: 10.4018/978-1-7998-1730-7.ch012

[63] Eakin CM, Sweatman HPA, Brainard RE. The 2014–2017 global-scale coral bleaching event: insights and impacts. Coral Reefs. 2019;38:539-545. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-019-01844-2.

[64] Chavanich S, Kusdianto H, Kullapanich C et al. Microbiomes of Healthy and Bleached Corals During a 2016 Thermal Bleaching Event in the Andaman Sea of Thailand. Front. Mar. Sci. 2022;9. DOI: 10.3389/fmars.2022.763421.

[65] Nakamura M, Murakami T, Kohno H, Mizutani A, Shimokawa S. Rapid recovery of coral communities from a mass bleaching event in the summer of 2016, observed in Amitori Bay, Iriomote Island, Japan. Marine Biology. 2022;169:104. DOI: 10.1007/s00227-022-04091-2.

[66] Gudka M, Obura D, Mbugua J, Ahamada S, Kloiber U, Holter T. Participatory reporting of the 2016 bleaching event in the Western Indian Ocean. Coral Reefs. 2020;39(1):1-11. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-019-01851-3.

[67] IUCN. Guidelines for applying protected area management categories. 2008. DOI: 10.2305/IUCN.CH.2008.PAPS.2.en.

[68] Maestro M, Pérez-Cayeiro ML, Chica-Ruiz JA, Reyes H. Marine protected areas in the 21st century: Current situation and trends. Ocean Coast. Manag. 2019;171:28-36. DOI: 10.1016/j.ocecoaman.2019.01.008.

[69] Tuckett C, de Bettignies T, Fromont J, Wernberg T. Expansion of corals on temperate reefs: direct and indirect effects of marine heatwaves. Coral Reefs. 2017;36(3):947-956. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-017-1586-5.

[70] Giraldo-Ospina A, Kendrick GA, Hovey RK. Depth moderates loss of marine foundation species after an extreme marine heatwave: could deep temperate reefs act as a refuge? Proc. R. Soc. B. 2020;287(1928). DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2020.0709.

[71] Goyen S, Camp E, Fujise L et al. Mass coral bleaching of P. versipora in Sydney Harbour driven by the 2015–2016 heatwave. Coral Reefs. 2019;38(8). DOI: 10.1007/s00338-019-01797-6.

[72] Kim SW, Sampayo EM, Sommer B, et al. Refugia under threat: Mass bleaching of coral assemblages in high-latitude eastern Australia. Glob. Change Biol. 2019;25(11):3918-3931. DOI: 10.1111/gcb.14772.

[73] Banha TNS, Capel KCC, Kitahara MV, Francini-Filho RB, Francini CLB, Sumida PYG, Mies M. Low coral mortality during the most intense bleaching event ever recorded in subtropical Southwestern Atlantic reefs. Coral Reefs. 2020;39:515-521. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-019-01856-y.

[74] Mo S, Chen T, Chen Z, Zhang W, Li S. Marine heatwaves impair the thermal refugia potential of marginal reefs in the northern South China Sea. Sci. Total Environ. 2022;825:154100. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.154100.

[75] Lucas CC, Teixeira CEP, Braga MDA, Júnior FC, Paiva SV, Gurgel AL, Rossi S, Soares MO. Heatwaves and a decrease in turbidity drive coral bleaching in Atlantic marginal equatorial reefs. Front. Mar. Sci. 2023;10. DOI: 10.3389/fmars.2023.1061488.

[76] Roveta C, Coppari M, Calcinai B, Di Camillo CG, Marrocco T, Mantas TP, Puce S, Torsani F, Valisano L, Cerrano C. What's the key for success? Translocation, growth and thermal stress mitigation in the Mediterranean coral Cladocora caespitosa (Linnaeus, 1767). Front. Mar. Sci. 2023;10:1199048. DOI: 10.3389/fmars.2023.1199048.

[77] Dalton SJ, Carrol AG, Sampayo E, Roff G, Harrison PL, Entwistle K, Huang Z, Salih A, Diamond SL. Successive marine heatwaves cause disproportionate coral bleaching during a fast phase transition from El Nino to La Nina. Sci. Total. Environ. 2020;715:136951. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.136951.

**Tables**

Table 1 Number of publications by journals across literature included for this systematic map.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Journal Name | Number of Publications |
| Coral Reefs | 17 |
| Frontiers in Marine Science | 7 |
| Scientific Reports | 6 |
| Science of The Total Environment | 4 |
| Diversity | 3 |
| Global Change Biology | 3 |
| Marine Biology | 3 |
| Marine Ecology Progress Series | 3 |
| Marine Pollution Bulletin | 3 |
| PloS One | 3 |
| Proceedings of the Royal Society B | 3 |
| Bulletin of Marine Science | 2 |
| Ecology and Evolution | 2 |
| Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology | 2 |
| Limnology and oceanography | 2 |
| Molecular Ecology | 2 |
| Applied microbiology and biotechnology | 1 |
| Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems | 1 |
| Aquatic Ecosystem Health & Management | 1 |
| Biodiversity and Conservation | 1 |
| Biogeosciences | 1 |
| Cell Stress and Chaperones | 1 |
| Ecography | 1 |
| Environmental Science and Pollution Research | 1 |
| Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science | 1 |
| Frontiers in Physiology | 1 |
| Geophysical Research Letters | 1 |
| Helgoland Marine Research | 1 |
| Integrative Organismal Biology | 1 |
| Journal of Experimental Biology | 1 |
| Journal of Heredity | 1 |
| Journal of Marine Science and Engineering | 1 |
| Journal of phycology | 1 |
| Marine Chemistry | 1 |
| Marine Environmental Research | 1 |
| Microorganisms | 1 |
| Nature | 1 |
| Pakistan Journal of Biological Sciences | 1 |
| PeerJ | 1 |
| Progress in Oceanography | 1 |
| Regional Studies in Marine Science | 1 |
| The Biological Bulletin | 1 |

Table 2 Number of publications by ecoregions across this systematic map.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Ecoregions | Belongs to Province | Number of Publications Concerning the Ecoregion |
| Southern China | South China Sea | 15 |
| Western Mediterranean | Mediterranean Sea | 11 |
| Lord Howe and Norfolk Islands | Lord Howe and Norfolk Islands | 9 |
| Leeuwin | Southwest Australian Shelf | 6 |
| Gulf of Maine/Bay of Fundy | Cold Temperate Northwest Atlantic | 6 |
| Central Kuroshio Current | Warm Temperate Northwest Pacific | 6 |
| East China Sea | Warm Temperate Northwest Pacific | 6 |
| Houtman | West Central Australian Shelf | 5 |
| Gulf of Tonkin | South China Sea | 4 |
| Arabian (Persian) Gulf | Somali/Arabian | 3 |
| Tweed-Moreton | East Central Australian Shelf | 3 |
| Carolinian | Warm Temperate Northwest Atlantic | 3 |
| Central and Southern Great Barrier Reef | Northeast Australian Shelf | 2 |
| Azores Canaries Madeira | Lusitanian | 2 |
| Southeastern Brazil | Warm Temperate Southwestern Atlantic | 2 |
| Floridian | Tropical Northwestern Atlantic | 2 |
| Eastern Brazil | Tropical Southwestern Atlantic | 2 |
| Cape Howe | Southeast Australian Shelf | 2 |
| Northeastern Brazil | Tropical Southwestern Atlantic | 2 |
| Adriatic Sea | Mediterranean Sea | 2 |
| Torres Strait Northern Great Barrier Reef | Northeast Australian Shelf | 1 |
| Northern Gulf of Mexico | Warm Temperate Northwest Atlantic | 1 |
| Levantine Sea | Mediterranean Sea | 1 |
| Natal | Agulhas | 1 |
| Western India | West and South Indian Shelf | 1 |
| West Caroline Islands | Tropical Northwestern Pacific | 1 |
| Andaman Sea Coral Coast | Andaman | 1 |
| South Kuroshio | South Kuroshio | 1 |
| Ningaloo | Northwest Australian Shelf | 1 |
| Ionian Sea | Mediterranean Sea | 1 |
| Mascarene Islands | Western Indian Ocean | 1 |
| Manning-Hawkesbury | East Central Australian Shelf | 1 |
| South China Sea Oceanic Islands | South China Sea | 1 |
| South European Atlantic Shelf | Lusitanian | 1 |
| Delagoa | Western Indian Ocean | 1 |

Table 3 List of identified marine reserve, protected area, or marine park.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Name of Protected Area | Country | Reference |
| Abrolhos Marine National Park | Brazil | Ferreira et al., 2021 |
| Blue Bay Marine Park | Mauritius | McClanahan et al., 2021 |
| Columbretes Islands Marine Protected Area | Spain | Kersting et al., 2015 |
| Medes Island Marine Protected Area | Spain | Kersting et al., 2015; Gómez-Gras et al., 2019; Crisci et al., 2017 |
| Green Island Marine Research Station | Taiwan | Schutter et al., 2015 |
| Jurien Bay Marine Park | Australia | Ross et al., 2021 |
| Marmion Marine Park | Australia | Ross et al., 2021 |
| Rottnest Island Marine Reserve | Australia | Ross et al., 2021 |
| Shoalwater Islands Marine Park | Australia | Ross et al., 2021 |
| Ngari Capes Marine Park | Australia | Ross et al., 2021 |
| Lord Howe Island Marine Park | Australia | Steinberg et al., 2022; Davis et al., 2020; Oakley et al., 2022; Dalton et al., 2011 |
| Malvan Marine Santuary | India | De et al., 2023 |
| Scandola Nature Reserve | France | Crisci et al., 2017 |
| Mljet National Park | Croatia | Kružić et al., 2015 |
| Pedra da Risca do Meio | Brazil | Lucas et al., 2023 |
| Pedra Vermelha Restricted-Access Site | Brazil | Lima et al., 2016 |
| Solitary Islands Marine Park | Australia | Lachs et al., 2021; Dalton et al., 2011 |
| Tung Ping Chau Marine Park | Hong Kong | Chui et al., 2015; Chui et al., 2016; Chui et al., 2017; Chui et al., 2023 |
| Yan Chau Tong Marine Park | Hong Kong | Cai et al., 2018 |

Table 4 Studies that were conducted concurrently with extreme weather events.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Period of Extreme Weather Events | Study |
| Beginning of Austral Summer 2010 to End of Austral Summer 2011 | Bridge et al., 2014 |
| January 2019 to March 2019 | Davis et al., 2020 |
| 2015 to 2016 | Le Nohaïc et al., 2017 |
| February 2016 to August 2016 | Goyen et al., 2019 |
| 2020 to 2021 | Mo et al., 2022 |
| March 2019 to May 2019 | Ferreira et al., 2021 |
| Multiple events over the years of 2004 to 2019 | McClanahan et al., 2021 |
| February 2019 to May 2019 | Banha et al., 2020 |
| June 2017 to August 2017 | Ip et al., 2022 |
| August 2014 to September 2014 | Xie et al., 2017 |
| Within 2020 | Bergman et al., 2023 |
| February 2011 to April 2011 | Giraldo-Ospina et al., 2020 |
| December 2018 to January 2019, January 2019 to February 2019, March 2019 to June 2019 | Steinberg et al., 2022 |
| 1997 to 1999, 2001 to 2004, 2006 to 2009, 2011 to 2012 | Kružić et al., 2014 |
| April 2016 to July 2016 | Lachs et al., 2021 |
| 2014 to 2017 | Porter et al., 2021 |
| January 2020 to February 2020, February 2020 to May 2020, May 2020 to June 2020 | Lucas et al., 2023 |